Chapter 58 Research and Review Task Force Meeting Minutes

Thursday, September 23, 2021

8:00 AM – 9:30 AM

Roll Call

Task Force Members	**Facilitators**
Stevie Schmitz	Zach Hawkins
Gail Staffanson	Jacqueline Raphael
Susan Gregory	
Alison Harmon	**OPI Representation**
Emily Dean	Sharyl Allen
Karie Orendorff	
Lisa Schmidt	**Executive Support**
Lora Poser-Brown	Tristen Belnap
McCall Flynn	
Barbara Frank	
Curtis Smeby	
Mary DuCharme	
Gary Lusin	

Quorum is met with 13 Task Force Members

Meeting Start Time 8:01am

Recap of September 16ᵗʰ meeting

1. Zach Hawkins reviewed the last TF meeting and shared screen from the presentation to share progress.

Update on Sept 20ᵗʰ Feedback Group Meeting

1. Zach Hawkins reviewed the Feedback Group meeting via a slide on the presentation.
    a. FBG voiced several concerns for actions of the TF.
    b. Concerns about the process moving too quickly.
        i. Question from McCall Flynn about a revised timeline and if that will be brought to the TF?
            1. Zach Hawkins responds that there has been talk about the timeline and that a potential solution is to continue to meet but reduce to a less frequent meeting schedule in the future.
        ii. Emily Dean asks what the timeline would look like after the next two meetings and how the recommendations will be handled?
        iii. Alison Harmon makes comment that the language developed in 311 (b) and 616 does not do harm to the process.
            1. Zach Hawkins makes comment about the FBG feeling the EPPs are already doing this and did not want it in ARM.

Revisit Timeline

1. Zach Hawkins presents a [possible timeline for going forward](#) via the presentation.
   a. McCall Flynn voices concern about not presenting all changes to Ch58 at one time to CSPAC
      i. There is support in the TF for waiting to present to CSPAC until all recommendations are completed.
   b. Gary Lusin makes comment to ensure quorum is met for the October 7th meeting.

Discussion of Proposed Changes to Sections 311-15

1. Jacqueline presents the [ARM tracker with the recommendations for CAEP alignment](#).
2. TF takes a moment to review 10.58.311 changes.

(1) The provider ensures that candidates:
(a) ~~demonstrate~~ develop ~~a deep~~ an understanding of the critical concepts and principles of their discipline ~~and are able to use discipline-specific practices flexibly to advance the learning of all P-12 students toward attainment of college- and career-readiness standards;~~ and facilitates candidates' reflection of their personal biases to increase their understanding and practice of equity, diversity, and inclusion. The provider is intentional in the development of their curriculum and clinical experiences for candidates to demonstrate their ability to effectively work with diverse P-12 students and their families.
(b) apply their knowledge of the learner and learning at the appropriate progression levels. Evidence provided should demonstrate that candidates are able to apply critical concepts and principles of learner development, learning differences, and creating safe and supportive learning environments in order to work effectively with diverse P-12 students and their families.
(c) demonstrate an understanding of the 11 Montana teaching standards (ARM 10.58.501) within the categories "the learner and learning," "content," "instructional practice," and "professional responsibility;" apply their knowledge of content at the appropriate progression levels. Evidence provided demonstrates candidates know central concepts of their content area and are able to apply the content in developing equitable and inclusive learning experiences for diverse P-12 students. Outcome data can be provided from a Specialized Professional Associations (SPA) process, a state review process, or an evidence review of Standard 1 [legal to support cross reference to accreditation standard]
(d) use research and evidence to develop an understanding of the teaching profession and use both to measure their P-12 students' progress and their own professional practice; apply their knowledge of InTASC standards relating to instructional practice at the appropriate progression levels. Evidence demonstrates how candidates are able to assess, plan for instruction, and utilize a variety of instructional strategies to provide equitable and inclusive learning experiences for diverse P-12 students. Providers ensure candidates model and apply national or state approved technology standards to engage and improve learning for all students.
(e) apply ~~content and pedagogical knowledge as reflected in outcome assessments in response to standards of professional associations and national or other accrediting bodies;~~ their knowledge of professional responsibility at the appropriate progression levels. Evidence provided should demonstrate candidates engage in professional learning, act ethically, take responsibility for student learning, and collaborate with others to work effectively with diverse P-12 students and their families.
(f) demonstrate skills and commitment that afford all P-12 students access to rigorous college- and career-ready standards; and
(g) integrate technology in the design, implementation, and assessment of learning experiences to engage P-12 students, improve learning, and enrich professional practice.

   i. Emily Dean asks question about what standard 1 is in 10.58.311 (c)
      1. Group concurs that cross referencing needs to be put in place which is something OPI legal will handle.
   b. Opportunity for public comment before the vote
   c. TF votes on suggested changes to 10.58.311

        i. Emily Dean yes
       ii. Curtis Smeby Yes
      iii. Susan Gregory Yes
      iv. Allison Harmon Yes
       v. McCall Flynn Yes
      vi. Gail Staffanson Yes

      vii. Barbara Frank Yes
    viii. Karie Orenforff Yes
      ix. Mary DuCharme Yes
       x. Gary Lusin Yes
      xi. Lisa Schmidt Yes
     xii. Stevie Schmitz Yes

    d. Vote passes unanimously with 12 TF votes
  3. TF takes a moment to review 10.58.312 suggested changes

---

(1) The provider:

(a) ensures ~~that~~ effective partnerships and high-quality clinical practice are central to candidate preparation. These experiences should be designed to develop candidates' ~~so that candidates develop the~~ knowledge, skills, and professional dispositions ~~necessary~~ to demonstrate positive impact on diverse ~~all~~ P-12 students' learning and development. High quality clinical practice offers candidates experiences in different settings and modalities, as well as with diverse P-12 students, schools, families, and communities. Partners share responsibility to identify and address real problems of practice candidates experience in their engagement with P-12 students.

(b) ~~ensures that partners~~ co-constructs mutually beneficial P-12 school and community arrangements~~, including technology-based collaborations~~ for clinical preparation and share responsibility for continuous improvement of candidate preparation. Partnerships for clinical preparation can follow a range of forms, participants, and functions. They establish mutually agreeable expectations for candidate entry, preparation, and exit; ensure that theory and practice are linked; maintain coherence across clinical and academic components of preparation; and share accountability for candidate outcomes; to the extent possible, providers and school partners co-construct opportunities for students to student teach in the district and school of their choice, including through recruitment and retention programs adopted by school districts, in accordance with statewide agreements among providers;

(c) ensures that partners co-select, prepare, evaluate, and support~~, and retain~~ high-quality clinical educators, both provider- and school-based, who demonstrate a positive impact on candidates' development and diverse P-12 student learning and development. ~~In collaboration with their partners, the provider uses multiple indicators and appropriate technology-based applications to establish, maintain, and refine criteria for selection, professional development, performance evaluation, continuous improvement, and retention of clinical educators in all clinical placement settings; and~~

(d) works with partners to design and implement clinical experiences, utilizing various modalities, of sufficient depth, breadth, diversity, coherence, and duration to ensure that candidates demonstrate their developing effectiveness and positive impact on diverse P-12 students' learning and development. Clinical experiences, ~~including technology-enhanced learning opportunities~~, are structured to have multiple performance-based assessments at key points within the program to demonstrate candidates' development of the knowledge, skills, and professional dispositions, as delineated in ARM 10.58.311.

---

        i. No TF comment
    b. Opportunity for public comment, no comment given
    c. TF votes on suggested changes to 10.58.312
        i. Stevie Schmitz Yes
       ii. Gail Staffanson Yes
      iii. Gary Lusin Yes
      iv. Lisa Schmidt Yes
       v. Curtis Smeby Yes
      vi. Susan Gregory Yes

      vii. McCall Flynn Yes
    viii. Barbara Frank Yes
      ix. Karie Orendorff Yes
       x. Emily Dean Yes
      xi. Allison Harmon Yes
     xii. Mary DuCharme Yes

    d. Vote passes unanimously with 12 TF votes
  4. TF takes a moment to review 10.58.313 suggested changes

(1) The provider:
(a) demonstrates that the ~~development of candidate~~ quality ~~of candidates is a continuing and purposeful part of its responsibility from recruitment, at admission, through the progression of courses and clinical experiences, and to decisions that completers are prepared to teach effectively and are recommended for licensure;~~ is the goal of educator preparation and that the EPP provides supports services (such as advising, remediation, and mentoring) in all phases of the program so candidates will be successful.
(b) ~~presents plans and goals to recruit and support completion of high-quality initial candidates from a broad range of backgrounds and diverse populations to accomplish its mission:~~ demonstrates efforts to know and address local, state, regional, or national needs for hard-to-staff schools and shortage fields. The goals and evidence should address progress towards a candidate pool which reflects the diversity of Montana's P-12 students.
(i) admitted candidates reflect the diversity of Montana's P-12 students; and
(ii) the provider demonstrates efforts to know and address local, community, tribal, Montana, national, or regional needs for hard-to-staff schools and current shortage fields;
(c) has a system for effectively maintaining records of candidate complaints, including complaints made to CAEP, and documents the resolution; sets admissions requirements, including the CAEP minimum GPA of 3.0 of the average grade point average of its accepted cohort of candidates, gathers data to monitor the applicants and selected pool of candidates and designs the selection to completion policy that includes multiple assessment measures to determine admission, continuation in, and completion of programs, including:
(i) data points that are reliable and valid predictors of candidate success and demonstrate that the standard for high academic achievement and ability is met through multiple evaluations and sources of evidence; ~~and~~
MOVE TO 315: (ii) data that is regularly and systematically compiled, summarized, and analyzed to improve the applicant pool, and candidate performance, program quality, and unit operations;
(d) establishes and monitors attributes and dispositions beyond academic ability that candidates must demonstrate at admissions and during the program, including selecting criteria, describing the measures used and evidence of the reliability and validity of those measures, [MOVE TO 314: and reporting data that show how the academic and nonacademic factors predict candidate performance in the program and effective teaching;]
(e) creates criteria for program progression and monitors candidates' advancement from admissions through completion; ensures candidates demonstrate the ability to teach to college- and career-ready standards; and presents multiple forms of evidence to indicate candidates' developing content knowledge, pedagogical content knowledge, pedagogical skills, and the integration of technology in all of these domains;
MOVE TO 314: (f) prior to recommending any completing candidate for licensure, documents that the candidate has reached a high standard for content knowledge in the fields where licensure is sought and can teach effectively with positive impacts on P-12 student learning and development; and
(g) prior to recommending any completing candidate for licensure, documents that the candidate understands the expectations of the profession, including codes of ethics, professional standards of practice, and relevant laws and policies.

  i. Note made by Jacqueline that sections that are proposed to move subchapters will no longer be in 313.
  ii. Emily Dean makes comment about 10.58.313 (b) replace America's P-12 students to Montana's P-12 students.
     1. TF supports this change.
 b. Opportunity for public comment, no comment given.
 c. TF Votes on suggested changes to 10.58.313
     i. Stevie Schmitz Yes
     ii. Emily Dean Yes
     iii. Mary DuCharme yes
     iv. Curtis Smeby Yes
     v. Susan Gregory Yes
     vi. McCall Flynn Yes
     vii. Gail Staffanson Yes
     viii. Barbara Frank Yes
     ix. Karie Orendorff Yes
     x. Gary Lusin Yes
     xi. Lisa Schmidt Yes
     xii. Allison Harmon Yes
 d. Vote passes unanimously with 12 TF votes
5. TF takes a moment to review 10.58.314 suggested changes

(1) The provider:
(a) demonstrates the effectiveness ~~impact~~ of its ~~completers~~ completers' instruction on P-12 student learning and development~~, classroom instruction, and schools,~~ and completer and employer ~~the~~ satisfaction ~~of its completers~~ with the relevance and effectiveness of ~~their~~ preparation;
(b) ~~documents impact on P-12 student learning and development using state-supported P-12 data and other measures employed by the provider, including employer surveys and program completer surveys;~~ demonstrates that program completers effectively contribute to P-12 student learning growth using state-supported P-12 data including employer and program completer surveys;
(c) demonstrates, through structured and validated observation instruments ~~and~~ (surveys, interviews, etc.) that ~~which~~ program completers effectively apply the professional knowledge, skills, and dispositions as ~~delineated~~ described in ARM 10.58.501;
(d) demonstrates that employers ~~,~~ using ~~measures that result in~~ valid and reliable data ~~that employers~~ are satisfied with the program completers' preparation for their ~~assigned~~ responsibilities ~~in~~ working with P-12 students; and
(e) demonstrates that program completers~~,~~ using ~~measures that result in valid and reliable~~ data~~, that program completers~~ perceive their preparation ~~as~~ relevant to the responsibilities they confront on the job ~~and that the preparation was effective~~.

       i. Note made to remember section will be included from 313 as suggested

      ii. No comment from TF, no objection to taking a vote.

   b. Opportunity for public comment, no comment given

   c. TF votes on suggested changes to 10.58.314

      i. Curtis Smeby Yes   vii. Gail Staffanson Yes

      ii. Susan Gregory Yes   viii. Emily Dean Yes

     iii. Allison Harmon Yes   ix. Barbara Frank Yes

     iv. Stevie Schmitz Yes   x. Karie Orendorff Yes

     v. McCall Flynn Yes   xi. Gary Lusin Yes

     vi. Mary DuCharme Yes   xii. Lisa Schmidt Yes

   d. Vote passes unanimously with 12 TF votes

  6. TF takes a moment to review 10.58.315 suggested changes

(1) The provider:
(a) maintains a quality assurance system ~~comprised~~ that consists of valid data from multiple measures, ~~including evidence of candidates' and completers' positive impact on P-12 student learning and development;~~ and supports continuous improvement that is sustained and evidence-based ~~and that evaluates the effectiveness of its completers~~; . The system is developed and maintained with input from internal and external stakeholders. ~~and~~ The provider uses the results of inquiry and data collection to establish priorities, enhance program elements and capacity, and ~~test~~ highlight innovations ~~to improve completers' impact on P-12 student learning and development;~~
(b) develops a ~~quality~~ functioning assurance system comprised of multiple measures that can monitor candidate progress, completer achievements, and provider operational effectiveness. The provider documents the process of data entry, how data are reported and used in decision making to make programmatic improvement;
(c) ensures ~~that its~~ the quality assurance system relies on relevant, verifiable, representative, cumulative, and actionable measures ~~data that are relevant, verifiable, representative, and cumulative; provides specific guidance for improvement; and produces empirical evidence that~~ to ensure interpretations of data are valid and consistent;
(d) regularly and systematically assesses program performance against its goals and relevant standards, ~~tracks~~ monitors results over time, tests innovations and the effects of selection criteria on subsequent progress and completion, and uses results to improve program elements and processes;
(e) ensures that measures of program completer impact on P-12 learning ~~and development~~ are based on established best practices, summarized, analyzed, shared widely, and acted upon in decision making related to programs, resource allocation, and future direction; and
(f) assures that ~~appropriate~~ relevant internal (e.g., EPP administrators, faculty, staff, candidates) and external (e.g., alumni, practitioners, school and community partners, employers stakeholders~~, including alumni, employers, practitioners, school and~~

   i. Note made to remember section will be included from 313 as suggested
   ii. Note made that new sections are included to align with standards
   iii. Mary DuCharme makes comment regarding a grammatical issue
   iv. Mary DuCharme makes comment asks for clarification about completer achievements in 315 (b)
      1. Ann Ewbank from the public explains what completer achievements are.
   b. Opportunity for public comment, no comment given.
   c. TF votes on suggested changes to 10.58.315
      i. Curtis Smeby Yes
      ii. Allison Harmon Yes
      iii. Gary Lusin Yes
      iv. Mary DuCharme Yes
      v. Lisa Schmidt Yes
      vi. Karie Orendorff Yes
      vii. Stevie Schmitz Yes
      viii. Emily Dean Yes
      ix. Gail Staffanson Yes
      x. McCall Flynn Yes
      xi. Susan Gregory Yes
   d. Vote passes unanimously with 11 TF votes.
7. TF looks at new standard recommendations
   a. Emily Dean asks to clarify why these sections are being included here
      i. Stevie Schmitz clarifies that they should be included in the 600 and 700 subchapters.
      ii. Jacqueline Raphael commits to making that change after this meeting.

Review and Discussion of Proposed changes to section 501

1. TF reviews edited recommendation to 10.58.501 (g)
   a. (g) Plan and implement evidence-based practices that support the diverse academic and social, emotional, and behavioral needs of all students plan and implement individualized instruction that supports students of all cognitive abilities in meeting rigorous learning goals by drawing upon knowledge of content areas, curriculum, cross-disciplinary skills, and pedagogy, as well as knowledge of learners and the community context;
   b. No comment from TF, no objection to taking a vote.
   c. Opportunity for public comment, no comment given
   d. TF votes on revised suggest
      i. Emily Dean yes
      ii. Stevie Schmitz yes
      iii. Karie Orendorff Yes
      iv. Mary DuCharme yes
      v. Curtis Smeby Yes
      vi. Allison Harmon Yes
      vii. Susan Gregory Yes
      viii. Gail Staffanson Yes
      ix. Gary Lusin Yes
      x. Lisa Schmidt Yes
   e. Vote passes unanimously with 10 TF votes
2. Stevie Schmitz explains document shared which summaries standards.
3. Stevie Schmitz explains changes made to the comparison chart highlighted in yellow are additional changes.

       a. Gary Lusin asks question to clarify if there is a documented code of ethics for administrators and teachers?
             i. Stevie responds that there is, and that could also be incorporated in the chapter if the TF felt it is needed.

Next Steps

1. Homework for the TF is to review the updated version of the ARM tracker.
2. Next week the time will be devoted to reviewing additional changes.

Meeting Adjourned: 9:32 am