



Social Studies Negotiated Rulemaking Committee – Minutes 12.2.2019

Contents

Call to Order	2
Committee Introductions.....	2
Confirm Facilitator	2
Confirm Committee Membership.....	2
Review Negotiated Rulemaking Roles, Responsibilities, and Process	2
Provide OPI’s Background and Context behind Rule Recommendations.....	2
Establish Committee’s Consensus Definition.....	3
Discussion of the revised Content Standards	3
Proposed Content Standard 1 and 2.....	3
Proposed Content Standards for Kindergarten	3
Proposed Content Standards for First Grade.....	4
Proposed Content Standards for Second Grade.....	4
Proposed Content Standards for Third Grade	5
Proposed Content Standards for Fourth Grade.....	6
Proposed Content Standards for Fifth Grade	7
Proposed Content Standards for Sixth through Eighth Grade.....	8
Proposed Content Standards for Ninth through Twelfth Grade.....	10
Proposed Social Studies Program Delivery Standards	13
Economic Impact Statement.....	14
Public Comment and Adjournment	14



Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:04 am by Office of Public Instruction (OPI) Content Standards and Instruction Division Administrator Colet Bartow. Housekeeping items, such as internet connectivity and speakerphones, were discussed.

Committee Introductions

Committee members, OPI staff, and facilitator Kirsten Madsen, introduced themselves and discussed how their experiences, expertise, and representation contributes to the committee's work.

Confirm Facilitator

Ms. Madsen reviewed her role as facilitator for the committee, and asked for confirmation of her nomination as facilitator. The committee voted unanimously to confirm Kirsten Madsen as facilitator of the negotiated rulemaking process. After she was confirmed as facilitator, Ms. Madsen reviewed the meeting agenda.

Confirm Committee Membership

Ms. Madsen asked the committee to verify their intent to part of the committee. Everyone present and virtually confirmed their intent to part of the committee. Committee member Leo Bird was not present at the meeting.

Review Negotiated Rulemaking Roles, Responsibilities, and Process

Ms. Madsen reviewed the roles and responsibilities of the committee in the negotiated rulemaking process, and the process itself. Ms. Madsen read a passage from the 1889 Course of Study for the Common Schools of Montana. The committee confirmed that the groups that would be the most impacted by the rule changes were represented.

Provide OPI's Background and Context behind Rule Recommendations

Ms. Bartow gave the big picture view as to why the committee was meeting. She reviewed the proposed timeline for the committee and stated the dates in the timeline reflect the statutory deadlines. Ms. Bartow reviewed the Montana Administrative Procedures Act (MAPA) timeline. The estimated adoption date for the revised Content Standards for Social Studies is September 2020.

Ms. Madsen reminded everyone that the meeting was a public meeting that was being recorded.



Social Studies Negotiated Rulemaking Committee – Minutes 12.2.2019

Ms. Bartow led the discussion about OPI's background and context behind the rule recommendations, and the work of the standards writing team. She reviewed the guidelines approved by the Board of Public Education (BPE) and that the Board approved the change to make all content standards go from kindergarten to grade 12 in 2016. She explained that the new content standards had to be free of jargon, measurable, and included the integration of Indian Education for All. Committee member Cherie Stobie asked about the guidelines changes, and Ms. Bartow said the Board of Public Education approved the guidelines.

Establish Committee's Consensus Definition

Ms. Madsen lead the discussion on what consensus means to the committee. The committee agreed that a thumb up meant they understood and were in agreement with the proposal; a thumb sideways meant they did not understand the proposal; and a thumb down meant they understood the proposal and did not agree with it.

Discussion of the revised Content Standards

Ms. Madsen led the discussion on the rule recommendations. The rule recommendations were reviewed section by section, beginning with Content Standard 1.

Proposed Content Standard 1 and 2

The committee read and discussed the proposed Content Standard 1 and 2. The committee discussed how proposed standard matched the sections of the College, Career & Civic Life (C3) Framework from the National Council for the Social Studies. Committee member Ty Moore explained the writing team's process. The committee discussed if psychology and sociology should be included. It was announced that psychology and sociology are included in the Health Enhancement content standards.

The committee approved the proposed Content Standard 1 and 2 as written.

Proposed Content Standards for Kindergarten

The committee reviewed the proposed content standards for Kindergarten. There was a discussion about how to introduce civic discourse to kindergartners, and whether or not that introduction overlapped with classroom rules and expectations. The integration of English Language Arts content standards with the Social Studies content standards was discussed. Mr. Moore said the goal of the writing team was to keep it simple and small for teachers and students. The committee revised proposed Content Standard 1 to include:

“c. demonstrate citizenship through their interactions in the classroom and school community”



Social Studies Negotiated Rulemaking Committee – Minutes 12.2.2019

The committee also discussed Content Standard 2 and how kindergartners could understand economics. Committee member Lynne Peterson said it could be something low key like a visit to the pumpkin patch.

Ms. Madsen confirmed with the committee that their questions were answered. The committee reached a consensus on the content standards for Kindergarten, and approved the content standards as revised.

Proposed Content Standards for First Grade

The committee reviewed the proposed content standards for First Grade. The committee discussed grade level progression of difficulty. The committee revised the proposed Content Standard 1 from:

“1.a. demonstrate being a citizen of a classroom and school community by following established rules and expectations”

to

“1.a. demonstrate being a citizen of a classroom and school community through interactions and by following established rules and expectations”

During a review of the content standards for Third Grade, the committee revised the proposed Content Standard 4 in First Grade from:

“4.b. understand how events might be described differently depending on historical contexts and perspectives”

to

“4.b. understand how events might be described differently depending on historical contexts and perspectives, including those of Montana tribes”

After reviewing the revised content standards, the committee reached a consensus and approved the content standards as revised.

The committee also noted various references to “Montana Indian tribes,” “Montana tribes,” “American Indians,” and other references. The committee instructed a consistent phrase be selected that can be used throughout, except where variation is intended (such as a focus on Montana versus the United States more broadly).

Proposed Content Standards for Second Grade

The committee reviewed the proposed content standards for Second Grade. The committee corrected a typo in 4.a. (“live” was changed to past tense, “lived”).

After reviewing the revised content standards, the committee reached a consensus and approved the content standards as revised.



Proposed Content Standards for Third Grade

The committee reviewed the proposed content standards for Third Grade. The committee discussed the integration of Indian Education for All in the standards. Indian Education for All division administrator Zach Hawkins explained how the decisions of where to integrate Indian Education for All were made. The committee decided to begin the integration at First Grade, and revised First Grade Content Standard 4 (as described above) before continuing their review of the proposed content standards for Third Grade.

Once they approved their revisions to the content standards for First Grade, the committee returned to their review of the proposed content standards for Third Grade. They discussed the grade level progression of difficulty. The committee revised Content Standards 1 from:

“1.c. identify key national symbols”

to

“1.c. identify key symbols of nations”

After reviewing the content standards for Sixth through Eighth grades, the committee revisited the content standards for Third Grade. The committee revised Content Standard 3 from:

“3.b. examine maps and other representations to identify historical and contemporary political and cultural patterns in the Americas”

to

“3.c. identify land forms and other physical characteristics of the Americas”

and to add as 3.b

“3.b. identify environmental and technological events and conditions that impact humans

The committee revised Content Standard 4 from:

“4.a. identify Montana tribes by their historic and contemporary name”

to

“4.a. identify Montana tribes by their original and current names”

After reviewing the revised content standards, the committee reached a consensus and approved proposed content standards as revised.



Proposed Content Standards for Fourth Grade

The committee reviewed the proposed content standards for Fourth Grade. A major error was discovered in the initial review, and the committee decided that they would review the content standards once the major error was fixed.

After the major error was fixed, the committee reviewed the proposed content standards. There was a discussion about integrating Indian Education for All into the standards. The committee revised Content Standard 1 from:

“1.c. describe how rules, laws, and policies are implemented by local, state, and tribal governments”

to

“1.c. describe how rules, laws, and policies are implemented by local, state, national and tribal governments”

The committee revised Content Standard 2 from:

“2.a. identify the various incentives that influence the decisions people make in short term and long term situations”

“2.c. identify various resources that are used to provide goods and services in Montana”

to

“2.a. identify the various pressures and incentives that influence the decisions people make in short term and long term situations”

“2.c. identify various resources and labor that are used to provide goods and services in Montana”

The committee revised Content Standard 4 from:

“4.b. identify events and policies that have impacted by Montana’s tribes”

“4.c. explain how Montana has changed over time and this history impacts the present”

to

“4.b. identify events and policies that have impacted and been influenced by Montana’s tribes”

“4.c. explain how Montana has changed over time, given its cultural diversity, and this history impacts the present”

After reviewing the revised content standards, the committee reached a consensus and approved proposed content standards as revised.



Proposed Content Standards for Fifth Grade

The committee reviewed the proposed content standards for Fifth Grade. The committee discussed if interest rates was developmentally appropriate topic for fifth graders. The committee determined it was developmentally appropriate since the topic corresponded to the Math content standards for Fifth Grade. The committee also discussed where to integrate Indian Education for All in the standards.

The committee revised Content Standard 1 from:

“1.a. examine the origins, ideals, and purposes of rules, laws, and key U.S. constitutional provisions and other foundational documents”

to

“1.a. examine the diverse origins, ideals, and purposes of rules, laws, and key U.S. constitutional provisions and other foundational documents”

The committee revised Content Standard 2 from:

“2.c. identify resources that are used to produce goods and services”

to

“2.c. identify resources and labor that are used to produce goods and services”

The committee corrected the typo in content standard 2.e. (“State” to “States”).

After reviewing the content standards for Sixth through Eighth grades, the committee revisited the content standards for Fifth Grade. The committee revised Content Standard 3 from:

“3.a. identify and label US states, territories, and their capitals/major cities”

to

“3.a. identify and label US regions, territories, states and their capitals/major cities”

After reviewing the revised content standards, the committee reached a consensus and approved proposed content standards as revised.

The committee also noted various references to “US,” “U.S.,” and “the United States.” The committee instructed these should be consistent (where appropriate) and follow a style manual appropriate to Administrative Rules.



Proposed Content Standards for Sixth through Eighth Grade

The committee reviewed the proposed content standards for Sixth through Eighth Grade. There was a discussion of how the standards will work at the school district level. The committee reviewed the content standards one by one since the standards for Sixth through Eighth Grade covered three grade levels.

The committee revised Content Standard 1 from:

- “1.d. distinguish the structure, organization, powers, and limits of government at the local, state and tribal levels
- 1.e. identify efforts to ensure that key U.S. principles of equality and civil rights are applied to various groups, including American Indians”

to

- “1.d. distinguish the structure, organization, powers, and limits of government at the local, state, national and tribal levels
- 1.e. identify events and leaders that ensure that key U.S. principles of equality and civil rights are applied to various groups, including American Indians”

The committee corrected the typo in content standard 1.g. (“issue” to “issues”).

After reviewing the revisions, the committee reached a consensus and approved the proposed Content Standard 1 as revised.

The committee revised Content Standard 2 from:

- “2.c. explain the roles of buyers and sellers in product, labor, and financial markets
- 2.f. explain how changes in supply and demand cause changes in prices and quantities of goods, services, and other capital”

to

- “2.c. explain the roles of producers and consumers in market systems
- 2.f. explain how changes in supply, demand, and labor standards cause changes in prices and quantities of goods, services, and other capital”

After reviewing the revisions, the committee reached a consensus and approved the proposed Content Standard 2 as revised.

The committee revised Content Standard 3 from:

- “3.e. explain the role of spatial patterns of settlement and movement in shaping societies and cultures, including Indigenous cultures”

to



Social Studies Negotiated Rulemaking Committee – Minutes 12.2.2019

“3.e. explain the role and impact of spatial patterns of settlement and movement in shaping societies and cultures, including Indigenous cultures”

After reviewing the revisions, the committee reached a consensus and approved the proposed Content Standard 3 as revised.

The committee revised Content Standard 4 from:

- “4.a. identify elements of change and continuity across historical eras in Montana, America, and world history
- 4.b. analyze how historical events relate to one another and are shaped by historical context
- 4.c. analyze how historical events and policies have impacted American Indian societies since European contact
- 4.h. identify limitations and biases in primary and secondary sources, specifically regarding misinformation, myths, and stereotypes about American Indians”

to

- “4.a. explore complex civilizations, and identify elements of change and continuity across historical eras in Montana, the Americas, and world history
- 4.b. analyze how the historical events relate to one another and are shaped by historical context, including societies in the Americas
- 4.c. analyze how, since European contact, historical events and policies have mutually impacted American Indian and European societies
- 4.h. identify limitations and biases in primary and secondary sources, specifically regarding misinformation and stereotypes”

After reviewing the revisions, the committee reached a consensus and approved the proposed Content Standard 4 as revised.



Proposed Content Standards for Ninth through Twelfth Grade

The committee reviewed the proposed content standards for Ninth through Twelfth Grade. There was a discussion adding news reporting and social media to the content standards. OPI English Language Arts Instruction Coordinator Christy Mock-Stutz said that news reporting and social media are included in the Library Media and Technology Standards. The committee reviewed the content standards one by one since the standards for Ninth through Twelfth Grade covered four grade levels.

The committee revised Content Standard 1 from:

- “1.b. analyze the impact of constitutions, laws, treaties and international agreements on the maintenance of international relationships
- 1.e. explain how citizens and institutions address social and political problems at the local, state, tribal, national and/or international level
- 1.i. evaluate government procedures for making civic decisions at the local, state, national, tribal, and international levels
- 1.k. analyze the impact and roles of personal interests and perspectives on the application of civic virtues, democratic principles, constitutional rights, and human rights”

to

- “1.b. analyze the impact of constitutions, laws, treaties and international agreements on the maintenance of domestic and international relationships
- 1.e. evaluate how citizens and institutions address social and political problems at the local, state, tribal, national and/or international level
- 1.i. evaluate government procedures for making decisions at the local, state, national, tribal, and international levels
- 1.k. analyze the impact and roles of personal interests and perspectives of market media and group influences on the application of civic virtues, democratic principles, constitutional rights, and human rights”

After reviewing the revisions, the committee reached a consensus and approved the proposed Content Standard 1 as revised.

The committee revised Content Standard 2 from:

- “2.a. analyze how incentives impact economic choices and their costs and benefits for different groups, including American Indians
- 2.c. analyze the ways in which incentives influence what is produced and distributed in a market system
- 2.d. evaluate the extent to which competition among sellers and among buyers exists in specific markets



Social Studies Negotiated Rulemaking Committee – Minutes 12.2.2019

2.f. evaluate benefits, costs, and possible outcomes of government policies to improve market outcomes”

to

“2.a. analyze how pressures and incentives impact economic choices and their costs and benefits for different groups, including American Indians

2.c. analyze the ways in which pressures and incentives influence what is produced and distributed in a market system

2.d. evaluate the extent to which competition among producers, among buyers, and among laborers exists in specific markets

2.f. evaluate benefits, costs, and possible outcomes of government policies to influence market outcomes”

After reviewing the revisions, the committee reached a consensus and approved the proposed Content Standard 2 as revised.

The committee revised Content Standard 3 from:

“3.d. analyze relationships and interactions within and between human and physical systems to explain reciprocal influences that occur among them

3.h. evaluate the consequences of human-made and natural catastrophes on global trade, politics, and human migration”

to

“3.d. analyze relationships and interactions within and between human and physical systems to explain reciprocal influences that occur among them, including American Indians

3.h. evaluate the consequences of human-driven and natural catastrophes on global trade, politics, and human migration”

After reviewing the revisions, the committee reached a consensus and approved the proposed Content Standard 3 as revised.

The committee revised Content Standard 4 from:

“4.c. identify ways in which people exercise agency in difficult historical, contemporary, and tribal contexts

4.g. analyze how historical, social, political, ideological, and economic contexts shape people’s perspectives

4.j. analyze unique perspectives of American Indians in US History

4.k. evaluate the limitations, biases, and credibility of various sources, especially regarding misinformation, myths, and stereotypes regarding American Indians”

to



Social Studies Negotiated Rulemaking Committee – Minutes 12.2.2019

“4.c. identify ways in which people and groups exercise agency in difficult historical, contemporary, and tribal contexts

4.g. analyze how historical, cultural, social, political, ideological, and economic contexts shape people’s perspectives

4.j. analyze perspectives of American Indians in US History

4.k. evaluate the limitations, biases, and credibility of various sources, especially regarding misinformation and stereotypes”

After reviewing the revisions, the committee reached a consensus and approved the proposed Content Standard 4 as revised.



Proposed Social Studies Program Delivery Standards

The committee reviewed the proposed Social Studies program delivery standards as revised by the writing team. The committee decided not to accept the writing team’s revision to 1.a.ii:

“Teach the skills necessary for individual civic competence in order to support the democratic process.”

The committee revised 1.a.ii from:

“support the democratic process to promote a learning environment to foster individual civic competence; and”

to

“support the democratic process and teach the skills necessary to promote a learning environment to foster individual civic competence; and”

The committee revised 1.a.iii from:

“integrate knowledge, skills, beliefs, values, and attitudes within and across disciplines to promote active citizenship.”

to

“integrate knowledge, skills, beliefs, values, and attitudes within and across the four content areas listed on [X-REF to Content Standard 1] to promote active citizenship.”

The committee revised 1.b from:

“(i) incorporate inquiry skills and strategies using both primary and secondary resources;
(ii) promote social criticism and socialization as a commitment to social responsibility;
(iv) promote decision-making skills and civic responsibilities through active participation (e.g. service learning projects); and”

to

“(i) incorporate inquiry skills and strategies using a variety of both primary and secondary resources;
(ii) promote socialization and social criticism through civic discourse and critical thinking as a commitment to civic responsibility;
(iv) promote decision-making and critical thinking skills and civic responsibilities through active participation across the four content areas listed on [X-REF to Content Standard 1]; and”



Social Studies Negotiated Rulemaking Committee – Minutes 12.2.2019

After reviewing the revisions, the committee reached a consensus and approved the proposed program delivery standards as revised.

Economic Impact Statement

Ms. Bartow led the review of the draft Economic Impact Statement survey. Committee member Betsy Kohnstamm asked why the survey was long, and Ms. Bartow explained that not all sections of the survey are required. Ms. Madsen explained the statutory requirement for the survey.

Ms. Bartow proposed to the committee that the January 8, 2020 meeting scheduled for the committee be cancelled, since the committee completed its primary review work and another meeting was not needed prior to conclusion of the Economic Impact Survey, and associated Statement. Ms. Madsen and committee member Matthew Schertz agreed.

Public Comment and Adjournment

Ms. Bartow reviewed where the committee was in the negotiated rule making process. The next meeting date was announced as Monday, February 8, 2020. Ms. Madsen thanked the committee for its work.

Ms. Madsen asked for public comment about the committee's work and the day's proceedings. Finding none, the meeting was adjourned at 4:37 pm.